TPP for Regional Agricultural Systems: Threat, Problem or Opportunity?

Robert Scollay,
NZ APEC Study Centre, University of Auckland

Presented at
2011 PECC Agricultural and Food Policy Forum
Taipei, 1-2 December 2011

Motivation and Outline

Motivation

- Perceived threat of TPP to agricultural sectors of potential members seen as a constraint on realisation of TPP's potential
- Can TPP be seen as an opportunity instead?

Outline

- Experience with agriculture in trade agreements to date
- Outline of the TPP
- Alternative Views of TPP and Agriculture (with case study)
 - the perceived threat
 - the prospective opportunity

Agriculture in Trade Agreements

Multilateral

- Near total exclusion under GATT
- Inclusion as a special case in WTO's URAA
- Stumbling block in DDA

Regional/Preferential Agreements

- Separate system in EU
- Special case in most RTAs/PTAs
 - complete or partial exclusion
 - "safety valve" provisions: TRQs, special safeguards
- Is there any reason to believe TPP will be different?

TPP: Background

- began life as a plurilateral FTA among 4 minor economies (P4) on both sides of the Pacific
- transformed by participation of US
- now involves 9 participants
- high level of ambition: aimed at
 - comprehensiveness
 - inclusion of "next generation" issues
- nine negotiating rounds 2010-2011

TPP: Significance

- limited trade impact of TPP among existing participants
- significance derives from potential as precursor of FTAAP (Free Trade Area of Asia-Pacific)
- TPP endorsed by APEC leaders 2010 as one of three avenues to FTAAP
 - TPP
 - ASEAN Plus 3 (EAFTA)
 - ASEAN Plus 6 (CEPEA)
- ASEAN developing "ASEAN Plus Plus" as new "ASEAN Plus" alternative to TPP
- Key questions
 - Does East Asia want to join with US in a trans-Pacific integration process?
 - Can TPP attract major East Asian participation?
 - Can "ASEAN Plus Plus" satisfy major Northeast Asian partners and/or accommodate US?

TPP: State of Play

- Existing participants announced outline of agreement at APEC's Hawaii Summit
 - full coverage of "conventional issues"
 - extensive range of "new" issues
 - no suggestion yet of major "carve-outs
 - negotiation of most sensitive issues yet to begin
 - key question: will benefits match "cost" of concessions?
- Japan, Canada and Mexico announced intentions to join
 - Next steps: bilateral consultations leading to consensus decision by existing participants
- Outlook: some important considerations
 - Comfortable passage of Korea/Colombia/Panama FTAs in US Congress
 - Participation of Japan etc will significantly alter benefit/cost ratios
 - Unresolved issues surrounding China's possible participation

TPP and Agriculture

Conventional wisdom

- aspirations of high quality agreement will be frustrated by agricultural sensitivities
 - US, Japan, Canada, Indonesia.....

Alternative Perspective

- Can TPP provided sufficient incentive (benefits of participation, costs of non-participation) for breakthroughs in agricultural policy reform?
 - Can the TPP be a "tipping point"?

Case Study – Japan: Japan's Agriculture Today

- Accelerating decline "free fall decline" (Yamashita)
 - rapidly ageing farmer population deriving most of their income from non-farm activities
 - average farm size far below minimum economic scale in most of Japan
 - cost of protection exceeds the value of production (Yamashita)
 - market forces failing to promote land consolidation
 - blockages in land-use policy
 - support policies encourage persistence of small-scale farming
 - ferocious rearguard actions by MAFF and cooperative movement
 - entrenched political interests supporting status quo

Case Study – Japan Imperative of Internationalisation

- Increased productivity growth essential to
 - counter stagnation of the Japanese economy
 - sustain economic growth in the face of
 - falling population
 - necessity of fiscal adjustment
- Role of internationalisation in spurring increased productivity growth
- Competitive threat from other FTAs
 - especially KORUS, Korea-EU
- Can TPP be decisive in overcoming agriculture's "block" on internationalisation and leading to structural reform in Japan's agriculture?
 - reform and revitalisation rather than "death" of Japan's agriculture?

Case Study – Japan Advantages of Agricultural Reform

"Vision" of a reformed Japanese agriculture (Honma, Yamashita, Godo)

- based on core areas of large-scale farmers
- policies supportive of large-scale farming
 - changes in land-use policy
 - financial support for exit of small-scale farmers
 - improved access to finance for large-scale farmers
- competitiveness promoted by opening to imports and resulting fall in prices
- Japan becomes an exporter of high quality agricultural products

Can TPP be a catalyst for realisation of this "vision"?